

ARTWORKS CYMRU PARTICIPATORY ARTS RESEARCH AND EVALUATION CASE STUDY REPORT

W. KEAY-BRIGHT; L. MACLAUGHLIN

On behalf of Cognis Ltd.

Cognis conduct Research and experimental development on social sciences and humanities

1. OVERVIEW

The case studies presented below were undertaken as part of the Artworks Cymru Research and Evaluation Project. They demonstrate real projects in Wales using selected Artworks Cymru Evaluation cards to evaluate various aspects of their projects at different stages of development. The projects capture information within different context and offer insight into the variety of reasons for evaluation both personal and systemic.

Each case study contributor was provided with an introduction to the research project via email, which was followed up by a face-to-face meeting to discuss the details of each project including the evaluation card swatches. We also used this opportunity to draw attention to the ethical implications of the research. Given the visual nature of certain arts practices, and the potential to gather participant data using video, photography, drawings and graphical modelling, our objective was to assist artists in identifying the likely ethical issues and how these should be addressed. The artists used the ArtWorks Cymru Information and Consent template to ensure that participants were fully aware that their involvement in the research was voluntary, but that their feedback could improve the quality of participatory arts practice and services.

CASE STUDY PARTICIPANTS

Touch Trust

Project Lead: Adele Gilmour

The Project: Touch Trust Movement Therapy Program

www.touchtrust.co.uk

Welsh National Opera Youth and Community

Project Lead: Louise Maddy

The Project: In Parenthesis Teach

www.wno.org.uk/youth-and-community

Dance for Parkinson's South Powys Parkinson's UK

Project Team: Heidi Wilson, Rosie Hazell

The Project: Strictly Parkinson's

www.danceforparkinsonsuk.org

Cwm Taf University Health Board and Artis Community

Project Team: Nancy Evans, Louise Shenstone and Alison Warner

The Project: Your Medicines, Your Health

www.cwmtaf.wales/tag/your-medicines

STIWIDO

Project lead: Louise Jenson,

The Project: Developing creative workshops for people with mental health conditions.

www.louisejensensite.wordpress.com

2. TOUCH TRUST

ABOUT

Touch Trust is a registered charity based in Cardiff, providing unique creative movement programmes for individuals with learning disabilities, those affected by autistic spectrum disorder (ASD) and complex needs.

GOALS

A core goal for the Touch Trust is to gather robust data that evidences the impact of their programme on Health and Wellbeing. To achieve this goal, they needed to explore methods that would enable staff to conduct research as part of their practice, rather than it become an additional, onerous activity. Not only would this approach provide rich insights into participant experience, but the research data could also leverage funding opportunities from new sources. In aligning these fundamental goals with the ArtWorks Cymru Quality Principles, it was agreed that by addressing such issues as Artistic Intention and Professionalism, all of the Touch Trust staff would be able to reflect on the holistic nature of the Touch Trust experience, and to use this to improve opportunities for staff development as well as the more traditional methods of evaluating the programme itself.

ARTWORKS CYMRU EVALUATION CARDS:

OPEN QUESTIONNAIRE, WORD CLOUD, PERSONAL INVENTORY, NEWS

METHOD

The focus of this case study aligned with the Quality Principle, *Intention*.

In order to discover authentic methods for undertaking research within the practical elements of delivering the programme the following cards were selected: Open Questionnaire, Word Cloud, Personal Inventory and News. The first card tested was the OPEN QUESTIONNAIRE. This method is designed to prompt informal conversations, which can lead to deeper reflection on a given line of enquiry. The following questions were used as prompts:

- What was the best part of your session today?
- What is the most important part of your practice overall/what could you not live without?
- Is there anything from the last session that you would change or do differently?
- Why do guests come (and come back) to Touch Trust
- Are there any key messages that you took away from the session?
- Did anything happen today that hadn't happened before/that you didn't expect?
- Is there anything else you would like to share?

Nine of the Touch Trust staff took part in this activity. Each person was interviewed for 15-40 minutes and answers were recorded on a Dictaphone. Conversations emerging from each interview were transcribed and key words selected to form a series of WORD CLOUD. *add image of WC card

Using the WORD CLOUD method, each of the questions was assigned a 'cloud' and reviewed, in order to clearly identify critical factors that could be made more salient for research as practice.

The PERSONAL INVENTORY method was also explored in order to reveal detail on activities, perceptions and values that might otherwise have been overlooked. *add image of PI card

Data from the PERSONAL INVENTORY card indicated a vital feature related to the research question, this is the importance of recognizing the role of the carer as a participant.

Touch Trust practice to help deliver the best possible session to the guests. Equally important was the highest standards of quality that the staff hold themselves to when delivering a session which in turn delivers the best possible care to each and every guest.

The evaluation process has also helped to generate NEWS – a method often used to grab attention by clearly stating benefits and unique features of a practice or project. Adele has been able to apply NEWS when seeking to attract new stakeholders, investors and funders. Following feedback from the staff the WORD CLOUD were developed into a series of post cards, so that the staff are more able to communicate key areas of their practice, understand its benefits in arts and wellbeing and generally feel more confident describing their motivations and priorities in the wider field.

ANALYSIS – USING THE CARDS

OPEN QUESTIONNAIRE: this method set the tone for the rest of the evaluation. The 6 simple questions asked in reference to the particular session just completed, encouraged more in depth reflection on activities during the session, who benefitted, and what they might like to modify or change.

All of the participants said that the questionnaires had enabled them to speak more openly about their practice and in more detail than anytime previously. In this context the questionnaires were critical to quickly establish the evaluation around the staff's perspective and understanding of their own practice. Asking questions informally in a conversational style also quickly established a degree of trust and rapport with the research evaluation team.

WORD CLOUD: once the interviews were transcribed the word cloud quickly identified important themes and clusters emerging, and helped to separate anecdotal, factual and emotive responses. The visual representation, a word cloud, was of great benefit as it provided immediate and direct feedback to the staff as they could 'see' their practice and the difference it was making. Adele after reading the clouds said, 'I couldn't help but cry when I saw the clouds and read the transcripts, it is sometimes easy to forget just how wonderful the people are who work here and the profound impact they have on our guests, the carers and really anybody who comes here!' In this case the word cloud was a perfect way to deliver results of an evaluation which primarily sought to extract information of the ways the staff understand and value their practice – caution is urged if using this method to look at

practices/groups likely to have highly different views on a topic or theme. Mind maps or un-focus are suggested instead.

PERSONAL INVENTORY: emerged as the logical next step after seeing the results of the WORD CLOUD. Staff were able to see what they and their colleagues value most in their practice and to identify common ground and interests. Touch Trust as a whole organisation was also able to document many of the things it identifies as being important.

Doing a personal inventory at this stage after the questionnaires drew out and targeted what the staff really personally find important. The below transcript is one example of many highly subjective interpretations of their sessions, but yet provide clear indicators of the artistic benefits of a session; dancing, singing, escapism, leading onto key health and wellbeing indicators; laughing, personal connection, exercise. 'one of my first sessions I was told not to be afraid to put enjoyment into your voice, now I am always whooping, and burring. It comes from experience, just letting go, once you are in the moment you are not shy. Everybody here has different skills and different backgrounds so you can pick up things from others. In my session just gone she just bounced in, music on full whack and literally danced like nobody was watching her, her male and female carer got involved and got stuck in, they just let go, it was just going with the person, enjoying the moment, it didn't matter what the next session was, or what was going on in my personal life, it was just soaking in what was going on with her smiles and her laughter, just soaking in her body language and her connections. I think this place is almost like therapy for ourselves, I don't know if anybody has said that to you yet, everybody has a personal life but coming into touch trust, as soon as you get started with a guest, you just forget everything you are just having fun with the person and just enjoying the moment, being happy with people, yea, like I said I am just smiling. I really noticed the days I am not in work I am nowhere near as energised!'

NEWS: As a charity which has impact on the arts and health and wellbeing sectors, investment and funding opportunities are ongoing. Therefore a 'NEWS' approach is not new to Touch Trust. However, through this evaluation process Touch Trust has been able to extract many of the sound bites from the interviews and apply them to a range of current bids and application to organisations such as Children in Need and the Big Lottery. Some Outputs of the NEWS method from the staff's perspective include:

'We deliver magic moments where you are completely embodied with the guest and you know that you can understand them, you have an open line of communication where anything is possible'

'We are achieving a state of enjoyment and the empowering of people, if you come out enjoying it as well, then you know it has gone well.'

REFLECTION

The Touch Trust staff had not previously considered verbal descriptions as a useful method of documenting their practice. Each participating member of staff stated that they struggled to articulate the more personal details; however, when asked in an open and sensitive way, the conversation began to flow quite naturally, and key aspects of the health, wellbeing and artistic nature of what they do, the benefits to guests, carers, staff, wider community and themselves, emerged using the prompts. All of the staff commented directly on the value of being asked questions. Simply having somebody to listen to their rich descriptions of individual practice was enjoyable, and encouraged them to visualise their practice in a wider context.

The openness of the interviews elicited some key issues for further staff development and organisational practice. This included more opportunities for disseminating, or sharing stories, amongst colleagues about their own experience of a session and ways to place emphasis on the guest's personal experience. As a result, Adele has identified the need to encourage staff development in ways which enable a more integrated, community of practice. With a greater sense of mutual ownership, the likelihood of maintaining overall standards and quality is predicted to increase.

FEEDBACK FROM CEO OF TOUCH TRUST

The method cards really helped us look at impact at a time when we needed to show, more than ever, that we make a difference to people's lives. Through careful consideration of the cards and working alongside the Artworks Cymru Research team, we were able to identify which methods best suited our ways of working and start to use them to show the difference we make. We received funding from Children in Need and they asked us to tell them how we would evidence the work of the project. We mentioned that we were part of the Artworks Cymru Research project and we would be capturing smiles through photos; ask children to draw a picture of their session and ask parents to keep a photo journal of their child in Touch Trust sessions. We wouldn't have used such creative methods without the support of the project.

In addition, I do some voluntary work with an Inclusive Leisure Charity in Bridgend called Every Link Counts. The Charity asked me to run a 'Forward Planning day' for members (young people and adults with learning disabilities) and their parents and carers. The focus for the day was on what our members wanted from future projects at Every Link Counts. I used the cards to get some discussion going about how we would show funders that their investment of funds had been a good one. I gave them some examples and we agreed that questionnaires and counting people were very important but more importantly, they could record video diaries, draw about their experience or keep a camera journal for themselves which would be shown to funders. They really 'got it' and the organisation will take forward some of the card ideas as a matter of course in its future work.

3. WELSH NATIONAL OPERA - IN PARENTHESIS TEACH

ABOUT

In Parenthesis Teach was a project run by Welsh National Opera's (WNO) Youth and Community programme. The programme aims to promote the WNO as an inclusive space where anybody can come and appreciate the arts, in particular opera. Project co-ordinator Louise Maddy contacted Artworks Cymru to engage more with ways of evaluating their project. David Jones book about World War One, In Parenthesis provided the theme for the project and was chosen to compliment the World premiere production of Iain Bell's opera In Parenthesis, performed by WNO in summer 2016.

The project worked with schools across South Wales in Communities First areas. Workshops with composer Helen Wood created melodies with the children and another workshop with animation company Gritty Realism created the images. The final film was shown to the children at a 'show back' event hosted by the WNO and included live opera singing, and a performance by Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama vocal students, with the focus of the event being the premiere showing of the animation that the 200 children collaborated on.

GOALS

Louise wanted to look more closely at evaluation having observed the benefits to everybody involved in the first project. Louise wanted to explore ways of capturing information that was directly related to the themes of the project; opera, World War One, and community engagement having found that previously these key themes often get lost when it comes to the final evaluations. Louise also wanted to explore ways of running more projects with children from disadvantaged areas to improve their access to the arts. After several meetings, the Artworks Cymru Research team suggested focussing on methods which are relevant and inclusive to enable staff to capture a broad range of perspectives and views on the benefits of this project and to use that information to develop and support further project.

ARTWORKS CYMRU EVALUATION CARDS:
PERSONAL INVENTORY, VOX POP, ROLE ON THE WALL, GUIDED TOUR

METHOD

Following an introduction to the Artworks Cymru Research project and members of the evaluation team attending two workshops run at the schools, Louise and the team agreed that the best opportunity to capture the participant's views was at the 'show back' event.

The event was meticulously planned by Louise ensuring that everybody got the most out of their time (9.30am-2.30pm) at the WNO. The day began with a screening of the children's film, with a live violinist playing the children's melodies. The children heard two performances by an opera singer as well as took part in a singing workshop, lunch, a tour of the building and a show by the RWCMD opera students. This left a 45-minute window to plan evaluation over lunch.

Cards selected by Louise and the evaluation team aimed to target views from the teachers, children and artists within a very short time frame. The first card tested was PERSONAL INVENTORY – a method often used to tease out key values – to pin down what Louise really wanted to learn more about from the evaluations on the day. The key areas were: feelings about opera; knowledge of World War One; and impact of bringing schools across Wales together all through the activities as delivered through the In Parenthesis teach project. To ensure that maximum number of participant's views were captured the team deployed a VOX POP – an approach normally deployed at large scale events 'pulling in passers-by' for a few moments to gain insights – method and decided beforehand to ask attendees about the following key themes:

Topic Guide 1, the ways the project impacted upon perceptions and knowledge of World War One. Perspectives: 1. Children 2. Teachers 3. Artists

- What one images pops into your mind when you hear World War One?
- Is there anything that you did to learn/remember more about World War One as a result of this project (focus on actions prompted e.g. I looked online, read the book, listened to teachers/facilitators, talked about it at home, watched the film, made animations)
- Is there anything that surprised you about World War One after participating in this project?
- Are there any key messages that you remember about World War One after participating in this project? (focus on how they remember them, e.g. from the songs, images, conversations, animations)

Probe/prompt as appropriate

Topic Guide 2, the ways the project brought schools and organisations together

Perspectives 1. Children, 2. Teachers 3. Artists 4. Project managers/leads

- Who have you met/spoken to during this project that you didn't expect to?
 - In your opinion, what is the most important part of being a part of a project so big?
 - 'The film that you helped to make will be shown all over the world'
- what does that make you think about?

Probe/prompt as appropriate

Topic Guide 3, the ways the project delivered messages about opera

Perspectives 1. Children, 2. Teachers 3. Artists 4. Project managers/leads

- What three words do you think about when I say opera?
- Do you think that opera is fun and entertaining, why?
- Was there anything about the project that made you think about opera differently?

Probe/prompt as appropriate

Teachers, Artists, Project team – Is there anything that you would do differently?

Teachers, - Can you give an example of a change in behaviours from any of the children?

Anything else you would like to add?

Each Vox Pop lasted between 3-5 minutes, nine teachers and assistants, one artist, and a senior WNO producer's views were captured.

In order to capture the children's views and perspectives a ROLE ON THE WALL – a method used to capture quick insights from larger often younger groups where time is limited – was used with the same questions from the Vox Pop written down on a large wall paper sheet. The Vox Pops and content from the role on wall were transcribed and put into their key themes for use by the staff at the Welsh National Opera. As the evaluation team and Louise also attended the 'show back' with the children, they were collectively able to undertake a GUIDED TOUR method – a way of noting people's experiences by following them through an event or activity – method to help pick out key moments that the participants really enjoyed, look at the organisation of the event overall and to make notes for planning future similar events.

ANALYSIS – USING THE CARDS

PERSONAL INVENTORY: with such a large-scale project with so many contributors it was critical to obtain a picture of what the project organiser really wanted to look closely at during the Artworks Cymru Research project. Without this it is likely that the evaluation team would have made their own judgements on what they thought was important and potentially missed the original objectives of their brief. These discussions with Louise also brought a degree of ownership from the project co coordinators as they have the expert knowledge of their own work, and also developed trust and relationships with the Artworks Cymru Research team assisting in the evaluation process.

VOX POP: Originally suggested as a method by Louise it was very efficient it talking to large numbers of different people at a very time limited event. The approach captured feedback from a completely unknown group, in an unfamiliar space and from participants whom might potentially feel inhibited with a more formal interview. The quickness of the 'chats' also provided a degree of focus, important quotes and insights without the need to go into long and in in depth interview formats.

Teacher - "The battle was something I was not familiar with. So before starting the project the children did some homework and as the children shared it (their homework) with me I

learned a lot about it (World War One). Some of them (the children) found some ancestors of their own and learned from their experiences from the war – really interesting.”

Teacher - “I think more so than before, I got a feeling for how it might have actually felt at that time. When people were performing the opera today and with the visuals (the film), I really got a feeling for what it might have been like, and what people might have been through. I think you might not actually grasp these feelings in a straightforward history lesson.”

Artist – “I love the modular effect of this, going in to do a workshop and just knowing that this one workshop will have value beyond the timescale of the workshop. Then to see it all coming together, so you know you have all done the same thing, but here is the final product of your collective efforts. This project enabled me to work on something where you are not being apologetic for not including something for example, every single one of the themes of the children’s is in there.”

Artist – “For me personally as a composer when I have written for other projects the director is saying it needs to be this or that. For this project the music has been at the forefront of it throughout. The music is not a by-product of the theatrical, the music is totally at the heart of it.”

ROLE ON THE WALL: using this method was important to demonstrate that children can and should be part of any evaluation where they are direct beneficiaries. The Role on the Wall helped to include perspectives from all of the children, and as they were asked similar questions to the teachers, there is opportunity to compare the children’s views and perspectives with the adults. While not every child wrote on the wall there was sufficient contribution to get a sense of what the children thought of the project overall, their level of engagement and understanding. Rather than seen as offering discrete indicators of success and benefits of the project, the children’s feedback should not be taken out of context with the event and other feedback (i.e. the children responded most to the opera questions but they had just come from hearing an opera singer for the first time).

Children - I like how they drag their voices, use their bodies. The Opera is very very cool!!! We got to hear amazing voices. It is so happy and fun. It is amazing that we get to see places that we would never have seen.

GUIDED TOUR: Both Louise and the Artworks Cymru Research team used this method during the event and had opportunity to feedback to each other straight afterwards and again the following week with the benefit of some reflection time. Using a guided tour enabled some of the most successful features of the event to come to light e.g. the awards ceremony for the children who ‘were just beaming after they received an award for their contribution’ and hearing an operatic voice for the first time the children ‘were just mesmerised by the whole thing, they will never forget hearing that for the first time’. The method also highlighted many things to consider for the future e.g. the time for children to all arrive and be seated needs some filler time and equally to account for schools who must travel farther home and therefore leave early.

REFLECTION

This was a large scale, big budget and time limited project run by the Welsh National Opera youth and community department. It was important to identify an appropriate opportunity to do evaluation, as it was impractical during school workshops, and to capture feedback

from the range of people involved in the project. Having the facility to ask the same themes to different people using different methods, helped to engage the WNO more in evaluation and to capture broad perspectives from the children as well as very particular insights from the teachers. The simple set up and condensed timeframe would be suitable for any similar large scale projects that the WNO undertakes in the future.

Keeping the evaluation focussed around 3 overall themes within arts and communities – compared to looking at more general indicators of benefit – has opened up many other pathways to potentially show the difference that the project made in the interim and longer term.

FEEDBACK FROM LOUSE MADDY, PROJECT MANAGER

It was a really brilliant day for everybody. We have had coverage from S4C; many of the children got to be on the news. The BBC also came and filmed as well. In terms of the event logistically it made sense to look at the lunch break to do the majority of the evaluations and we will certainly be looking more closely at this timeframe in future projects to capture the full range of people's experiences and feelings just coming here. You can see the full project on our Vimeo channel <https://vimeo.com/166405938> and this includes the animation that the 200 KS2 children collaborated on. We are also thinking more about legacy and how the children and teachers can have more access to their film in the long term. Helen created an audio recording of the separate melodies that the children created along with these motifs written on manuscript paper. This is an excellent follow up resource for the pupils to explore in music sessions back at school. We would also like to see the teachers perhaps run a session talking through the film in the classroom and discuss how individual art work was put together to create an impressive collaboration. Operatic engagement was a key driver of these projects and through the work of everybody involved we have managed to introduce over 250 children, their teachers, teaching assistants, schools and parents to the opera who otherwise may never have set foot in the building.

4. DANCE FOR PARKINSON'S SOUTH POWYS PARKINSON'S UK

ABOUT

Heidi is Senior Lecturer in Dance at Cardiff Metropolitan University, with a particular interest in dance for Parkinson's and dance with children and adults with learning disabilities. Her professional role involves teaching, performing, fund raising and managing projects, training, researching and writing. Heidi and Rosie are currently funded by the South Powys Parkinson's UK, to lead the Strictly Parkinson's sessions at Builth Wells.

An important driver for evaluating Strictly Parkinson's is to better understand the potential to extend the project to communities not currently served by National programmes. In the context of the Artworks Cymru Research project, understanding why people choose to participate is central to ensuring the longevity and legacy of the Builth Wells sessions. Heidi and Rosie are committed to establishing a regular programme of Strictly Parkinson's dance and to undertake further academic research for both Artworks Cymru and Cardiff Metropolitan University.

Due to the success of Strictly Parkinson's in Builth Wells, Heidi worked with Cardiff Met and Parkinson's UK Wales to research the potential interest in expanding the programme. Prior to running the sessions at Builth Wells, taster sessions were successfully completed in Newport, Dinas Powys and Pontypool, and a short evaluation was conducted using a paper-based evaluation form. This was not an ideal method as many people with Parkinson's

Disease find handwriting a challenge. However, support was available from friends and family to complete the forms.

The South Wales tasters grew out of the success of Strictly Parkinson's and were developed as a legacy of a Strategic Insight Programme (SIP) award, which Heidi received in her role at Cardiff Metropolitan University, School of Sport (CSS). Through this, a relationship developed with the Regional Director of Parkinson's UK Wales, Barbara Lock, leading to Strictly Parkinson's taster sessions.

GOALS

The goal for the initial phase of the Artworks Cymru Research was to investigate the research question using the user-designed ACE Cards, which allowed Heidi to investigate different ways of capturing participant feedback. Given the difficulties some people with Parkinson's experience with handwriting, the dance team were open to suggestions for using visual cues to prompt conversations, and to capture responses using audio recorders. In addition, it was proposed to video record a Strictly Parkinson's session, and to playback the footage at a later session in order to encourage a reflective conversation between participants and dance artists.

ARTWORKS CYMRU EVALUATION CARDS: INFORMED CONSENT, EMPATHY TOOLS, TIME TAGGING, PHOTOSTORY, VIDEO STORYTELLING, REFLECTION

METHOD

A Strictly Parkinson's session generally begins with refreshments as participants arrive. This gives everyone an opportunity to catch up on news. This particular session followed a three-week break due to the Easter holiday, meaning that there was more than the usual amount of news to share. Prior to this session, Heidi had emailed information about the Artworks Cymru Research project to each of the participants using a specifically designed INFORMED CONSENT information sheet and consent form, requesting permission to record conversations, to photograph and to video the session. The participants were given the opportunity to opt out of the AWC evaluation without it impacting on their participation in the Strictly Parkinson's sessions. No one opted out.

The session began with a short introduction, explaining that the goal of the evaluation for this session was to find out about their motivation for joining in the project, and to gain some insight into their very individual experiences. Rather than asking obvious questions, and to avoid any paper-based forms, the group were introduced to a simple card system that used images to trigger thoughts, memories and ideas. Heidi also explained that the session would be video recorded and photographed with the intention of inviting the participants to review the footage during a forthcoming session.

The rationale for using the images on cards was to prompt participants to talk with no predetermined agenda; in this respect, the card functioned as an EMPATHY TOOL to encourage the participants to share a conversation at the start of the session, and to move away from descriptions of the here and now, which could involve illness, stress or anxiety. EMPATHY TOOLS are usually objects or images used to enable facilitators and participants to find common ground, and thus develop an empathic relationship for practice and evaluation. The group were split into three smaller groups of four people, they were seated around a table and the card was placed in the middle. A voice recorder was used to capture the conversation, and, when indicated, the participants were given free rein to open a

conversation. The cards were design by Heidi, each card had one simple image. The ones chosen depicted a bridge, a shell, and a tree.

The Bridge group began by looking at the card and sharing ideas on what the image was, for example, a viaduct, aqueduct, set of false teeth, a face with big eyes. This immediately made everyone relax, one participant stated that it didn't really make him think of anything. Then the conversation moved onto local bridges, the landscape, and experiences from memory, particularly how the bridge reminded them of the Powys/Radnorshire boundaries, and identity associated with boundaries. This also elicited thoughts about time, how memories of such experiences seemed clear although the times had changed dramatically.

The Shell group began by asking who chose the card and why.

There was no obvious reason for choosing the card and the discussion quickly moved on to talking about the sea, the aesthetics of the beach, the vastness of the sea and the ways it is always in motion. This brought on reflections on time as well as the functions of the sea to feed people and as a recreational activity.

The tree group began by describing the colours and the contrasting seasons, especially as Spring is coming. The conversation quickly moved on to talking about change in the landscape through new budding of plants and the lambing season coming to an end (many of the group had experience of farming). Themes of new beginnings and feelings of a fresh start were clear in this group. It should be noted that, when this method is used a time limit needs to be imposed. Each conversation lasted longer than planned, which impacted on the time for dancing.

Following the conversations, the group organised themselves in a seated circle, ready for warm-up, and the Strictly Parkinson's dance began.

With agreement from Heidi, Rosie and the participants themselves, the session was photographed and video recorded. The video and photographs provided the opportunity to try out ACE cards TIME TAGGING, VIDEO STORYTELLING and PHOTO STORY as a method of evaluating experience from three perspectives: 1, artists (Heidi and Rosie); 2, participants and 3, the event.

TIME-TAGGING is a method of annotating video footage by placing markers at regular intervals. The method encourages the reviewer to observe anything that may be happening during the marked sequences, rather than seeking to observe specific behaviours. VIDEO STORYTELLING is a method of prioritising the "powerful voice" of a narrator, for example, a participant or facilitator. Short sequences of video are edited together and the narrator records the voice over the compiled footage. This prompts reflection on the action using a naturalistic, rather than authoritative voice. PHOTO STORIES are similar to VIDEO STORIES, however, by effectively "freezing" time they allow for reflection on moments, often capturing the essence or an experience, prompting deep reflection from the reviewer.

At the end of the session we repeated the EMPATHY TOOL card exercise. The end conversation for the Bridge group revisited memories, and made reference to time passing. This triggered a reminder that time is critical for someone with Parkinson's, as medication has to be administered at specific intervals. It was noted that dancing requires effort and concentration, and for that period of time it is possible to leave the condition behind. Medication, however, is the harsh reality.

When the session finished and the participants had left the building a short REFLECTION was conducted with the dance team. The artists noted that they don't often just get time to listen to the participant's experiences and feelings. The triggers prompted by the cards leading to quite philosophical and open ended discussions. The smaller groups also helped to manage and facilitate conversations and enabled the participants to feel listened to and this might have had influence on the dance. Some of the participants noted that the conversation was a bit like the dance in that there were no expectations and everybody could bring something to the table. This was a positive reflection on the methods. The empathy tools gave the participants an opportunity to look at things in a different way and their own way. The conversations became a part of the sessions as well as being a reflective tool. The cards enabled the participants to further explore their identities through personal views and experiences and this aligns with the aims of the dance sessions. The card system did 'flow' with the rest of the session by enabling participants to reflect on the images together and then contribute to the dance together. Some of the participant's comments provided useful insights into the benefits the participants get from the sessions, one commenting that she felt 'so much freer and more able to move' after a session and 'just felt so much lighter afterward'.

Following the session, the video footage was downloaded onto a computer and markers placed at 3 minute intervals to allow for TIME- TAGGING throughout the 15 minutes of video footage recorded at the session.

In addition, the photographs were edited into a sequence using iMovie in order to create PHOTO STORIES. The photo stories were then shown to Heidi for feedback, with a view to inviting the participants themselves to reflect on their experience at a future session.

ANALYSIS

The EMPATHY TOOLS provided the participants with the opportunity to start a session with their own conversation, avoiding the tendency towards talking about some of the more negative experiences of Parkinson's disease. The REFLECTION prompted the dance team to consider how EMPATHY TOOLS (check for name consistency) captured the participant feedback in a more person-centred manner. From these observations, suggestions were made for how to incorporate the tools into the design of future sessions, building on some of the emergent themes.

5. STIWDIO

ABOUT

STIWDIO is a new project which aims to develop arts practices and workshops specifically for people with mental health issues. Set up by Louise Jenson, pilot workshops were funded through a web-based crowdsourcing company 'Gofundme'. The course hosted five sessions over three weeks in Cathays Community Centre with 19 participants attending. All participants were from Cardiff and the Vale except one, a visitor from a similar project in Newcastle. All participants were experiencing or recovering from mental health issues including depression, anxiety and other chronic psychological health issues.

GOALS

Louise Jenson had set herself very clear targets from the outset:

'to test out the notion that being involved in a group-based artistic endeavour would be of benefit to people with mental health issues; to establish a group of interested participants who would like to form the basis of the new project called STIWDIO and take part in

developing it further; to see if there is a need/interest amongst this user group to establish a dedicated arts space to explore creative activities; to establish a link between the work of the University and an arts-based group such as STIWDIO, inviting Cardiff University to share the wealth of its resources and research with this community group and in so doing inspire the work of that group.'

Louise Jenson sought input from the Artworks Cymru Research team to look for more appropriate ways to capture feedback from the participants, whom she had observed anecdotally were enjoying the cathartic nature of the workshops, having a space to sit and engage with a creative activity as well as the sense of belonging emerging from the group. She was also seeking to attract further funding to sustain her creative workshops through setting up a dedicated space to host participants with mental health issues. Due to the very early stages of the projects development the Artworks Cymru Research team have suggested focussing on delivering purposeful, active hands on and reflective workshops to ensure a best practice for participants and a sustainable model into the future.

ARTWORKS CYMRU EVALUATION CARDS: PHOTO STORY, CLOSED QUESTIONNAIRES, EMPATHY TOOLS

METHOD

Members of the Artworks Cymru Research team sat in on one of the workshops which in this case was creating poems and visual representations using a very particular method used by Tom Philips in his book 'The Humument'. The technique in the workshops involved using elements of chance (throwing dice) to block out words on a page of the Humument until left with only a few words. Then the group drew images representing the words on the same book page. After the session, Louise and Artworks Cymru Research team discussed options to look more closely at the experiences of the participants bearing in mind the sensitivity of that particular group. It was agreed that it would be helpful to collect more information about the demographics of the groups attending the workshops through Closed Questionnaires. In a previous book binding workshop Louise Jenson had made a journal that was used to pass around to participants to capture feedback in their celebration event the following week. This PHOTO STORY method was also already a format familiar to the group, as books had been a consistent theme of all the workshops.

ANALYSIS

CLOSED QUESTIONNAIRES: captured descriptions of the people attending the workshop, where they came from, gender, age as well as a quick insight into their experiences of the workshops. This demographic information can be used to set up new partnerships in the early stages of project development. Cathays Community Centre has been provided with new information of the benefit they provide, as well as attracting the interest of 4Winds – a user led mental health resource –to work with STIWDIO on new workshops and activities. Most of the feedback on the questionnaires also supported the overall goals for the project.

PHOTOSTORY: was able to collectively draw together the intrinsic creative values of the workshops. For example, many of the participants fed back through poems and images. This was important as it kept the artistic merits of hosting sessions like this at the forefront of the evaluation. If the questionnaires had been used in isolation without the PhotoStory than many of the benefits of hosting highly artistic workshops might have been missed. The themes of the workshops also fitted nicely and seamlessly with this method in that there was no additional pressure or unwelcomed feelings by being asked to contribute to the PhotoStory by any of the participants.

REFLECTION: Prior to speaking with the Artworks Cymru Research team Louise Jenson had not considered most of the methods presented in the ACE system as a way to capture and evaluate aspects of her workshops. As this was the first pilot run there was clearly opportunity to tailor some strategies to capture safely the participant's views, perceptions and experiences in much more specific details than previously. The feedback from the participants through poem and images has the capacity to demonstrate the benefit of the workshops far more than simple questionnaires can. Louise Jenson said that for 'some people doing something creative or artistic, can be quite scary or intimidating but if you are allowed to do your own thing, it has an intrinsic value to it.' This is an important driver for the project creating artistic spaces for people with mental health issues to come along and just be in the moment, carry on what they are doing and at their own pace.

FEEDBACK FROM LOUISE JENSON WORKING WITH THE ACE CARDS

This project started with a visit to the Cardiff University Special Collections Library where the archivist Alison Harvey gave us a talk on illustrated sonnets of the 16th to the 20th century. In addition, she showed us the work of the contemporary artist Ron King, whose Book Art work is archived in the University. The showing provided an inspiring stimulus for the group and for the arts workers Sue Morgan (creative writing tutor) and Andrea Heath (community artist). The sessions were planned around the notion of words and images and the play between the two; how one can spark off the other.

Over the five days Sue and Andrea offered techniques and exercises to help us explore the relationship between the two and ways of playing with them. The central activity holding the five days together was the making of our own books. These gave members of the group the opportunities to incorporate the different techniques and ideas into the making of the books themselves and to experiment with different ways of illustrating them. One important factor in our work on the written word was the role of chance and choice, and Leah's description of the 'Humument' session was a good example of this thread which ran through the course.

The group has filled in the STIWDIO book as one way of feeding back on the course. The last session was a pleasure to be involved in. We had a delegate from Chilli Studios in Newcastle who worked with us to reflect on the project and how it had been for us. During the last activity participants were invite to create individual feedback and add it to the book. The participants also filled in a questionnaire the results of which are available in full on the ArtWorks Cymru website. We hope to be able to use this information to continue STIWDIO and run new and important creative workshops with people with mental health problems.

6. ARTIS COMMUNITY - YOUR MEDICINES YOUR HEALTH

ABOUT

Nancy Evans and Louise Shenstone from Artis Community worked in partnership with Cwm Taf University Health Board, primary school children and teachers across Wales to promote better use and storage of medicines. Nancy Evans in partnership with Alison Warner from the pharmacy department of the Health board ran lessons with pupils where the children came up with slogans and images to prompt people to think about the ways they use and store medicines. As a professional illustrator Nancy Evans used the designs to create a single screen printed A0 size textile poster. The wall hangings went on to be hung in exhibitions as well as being translated into a poster campaign rolled out across pharmacies', GP practices and other suitable places which can promote better use of medicines. The team are in the

process of finalising a teacher's pack to implement the art based learning program in the classrooms.

GOALS

Nancy and Louise originally approached the Artworks Cymru Research team as they wanted to look at evaluating this multi-disciplinary project from an artistic perspective. The project had clear impact from a number of perspectives (health and education) but the arts team felt that the artistic input and the difference that made was critical to gain a full picture of the project and plan for future work.

Through several meetings, the teams discussed the projects pathways to impact in health, education, intergenerational practice and interdisciplinary projects. In order to develop the teachers' pack and to frame the evaluation the Artworks Cymru Research team suggested to focus on methods which were, 'Inspiring Engaging and Challenging', to encourage the teachers to deliver the same standards as the project team and, to look more closely at the impact of making and exhibiting posters with important messages in real world settings from the children's perspective.

ARTWORKS CYMRU EVALUATION CARDS: TIMED ENTRIES, REFLECTION, CARD SORT, VOX POP

PART ONE METHOD

On 19th April 2016 the group had the opportunity to observe lesson 1 & 2 of the teachers pack in use for the first time. TIMED ENTRIES – a helpful way of noticing patterns and things not immediately seen as important by making notes at set intervals – were undertaken as the teacher began to deliver the lesson over 10 minute intervals.

After the lesson the group (Alison, Nancy, Artworks Cymru Research team, teachers and head teacher) reflected on the lesson to listen to what the teachers thought and fed back their insights.

Timed entries (every 10 minutes, as it was a short lesson with many things going on)

1.10 – Nancy wonders how the key messages can be delivered as so many teachers interpret the lesson differently. Suggestion key messages could be captured using Digital Storytelling and shown to teachers to embed within their individual interpretation of the lesson plan

1.20 – Teacher implements 'talking partners', a teaching strategy and a way to facilitate discussion and opinion in very large groups and with younger people.

1.30 – At an interval Nancy and Alison discussed the lesson so far. Alison briefly discussed the benefit of working with an artist saying it was her first time doing this and it had 'just been fantastic'. Alison knew she had to deliver this program, and really wanted to go into schools but didn't know how to do it until she was partnered with Nancy and Louise.

1.40 – Alison shares a recent article in a Health Board Wales Magazine which has used News Headlines to showcase the clear benefits of the project thus far and ends with some Long Range Forecasts in the article detailing where they want to take the project next.

Note, it would be good to pick out the artistic benefits of the project for future works building upon what has already been delivered.

1.50 – The timings of the lesson need work and clarification of confidentiality is needed.

2.00 – It seems unlikely that standards of Nancy’s posters can be replicated without her – lesson 3 (not today) will be crucial in delivering the artistic benefits.

2.10 – Slogans need to be short and snappy, some are too long.

2.20 – Alison says she would like to include school nurses in delivering the key messages.

2.30 – Alison notes that the teacher is delivering the session as a ‘teacher’ naturally would as she does not have expertise or experience with ‘medicines’ some of the key messages (prevention, cure, management) and the range of examples are being missed. This reinforces the idea to work with school nurses perhaps to come in to deliver a ten minute slot in the lesson plan.

2.40 – The class begin to make posters and Nancy suggests that the teachers need to guide the final Artform/Artwork at this stage - but she is not sure what the teachers have planned for the next session.

2.50 – Alison and Nancy note that the clarity and importance of the messages always need to be kept at the forefront of the lesson.

After the lesson the group (Artworks Cymru Research team, Nancy, Alison, Teacher and Teacher who helped develop the teaching pack) REFLECTED on the lesson and the children’s experiences. It was agreed that the key messages came across and will encourage children to pass on the messages at home. Teachers are all different and will modify their lessons but as long as all the main points are delivered this will be fine. The children really enjoyed it and shared a lot especially through ‘talking partners’ at the beginning. Teachers often use poster making as a teaching method but they don’t think about the posters leaving the classroom and being used as something that can potentially teach other people – this will need to be highlighted as an approach in this pack. With some minor tweaking, the lesson plan was very successful.

PART TWO METHOD

On the 8th and 9th June the Artworks Cymru Research team were able to observe lesson three – making posters – delivered by an artist and a teacher. This provided opportunity to co-design a CARD SORT – a simple way of understanding motivation and importance, can be text or image based and works with a wide variety of users e.g. children – to gather feedback from the children about various aspects of the project. Three themes; knowledge of medicine use, artistic skills and social impact with 9 key messages in each made up the card pack. Children were asked to pick up to three cards from each theme and then order them in order of importance. The exercise was repeated at the final Pier Head exhibition on the 23rd of June showcasing the posters and other outcomes from the project to funders and key stakeholders. The children were asked two primary questions, what they enjoyed the most and what they felt was the most important outcome from the project.

ANALYSIS – USING THE CARDS

A VOX POP – a method normally used at public events to quickly capture attendee’s perceptions and views – using a dictaphone provided opportunity to gather some final thoughts and insights as to the benefits and successes of the project, more particularly

focused on the artistic input and the attendees views the benefits of working with professional artists on this project.

TIMED ENTRIES – using timed entries helped those unfamiliar with the project to notate key elements as they emerged. The timed factor also enabled more detailed note taking as the lesson unfolded rather than trying to recall things after the event. Using time as a guide to make notes actually encouraged more reflection and detailed views of the session compared to making notes after a session. The 10 minute time scale was also useful as it kept insights quite concise and to the point. These insights might be helpful for later in projects at the write up stage or to demonstrate activities to other interested parties.

REFLECTION – enabled teachers to give feedback, feel part of the project and suggest ways they felt the lesson plan can be improved. They were also able to highlight any potential barriers for teachers delivering the pack such as inexperience and time constraints due to exam timetables.

CARD SORT – developed with input from all of the team picked out all of the key messages that the team would like insight from the children’s perspective. Set up simply as a card game the method was implemented in the classroom while the children were working on the posters and at the final exhibition. The three themes each had nine key messages they were:

Knowledge of Medicine

1. Read more about Medicine, 2. Out of Date Medicine Should be Returned to Pharmacy, 3. There is too much medicine being taken by people, 4. Plan your medication better, 5. Look at medicine differently, 6. Talk to your pharmacist about medicine, 7. Pharmacies are trying to reduce medicine use, 8. Keep medicines out of reach of Children, 9. People take too much medicine

Wider Impact

1. Telling social media about this project, 2. Being part of something big, 3. Seeing my work in an exhibition, 4. Going to an event, 5. Telling my friends about this project, 6. Telling everybody about this project, 7. Telling my family about this project, 8. Meeting lots of different people, 9. The whole class made this together.

Artistic benefits

1. Drawing pictures, 2. Making design decision, 3. Designing posters, 4. Learning new art skills, 5. Feeling inspired to make more art, 6. Screen Printing, 7. Learning about good poster design, 8. Working as part of a team, 9. Making catchy slogans.

Children said that, ‘Looking at medicine differently, Screen Printing, being part of something big, working as part of a team, seeing my work in an exhibition’ were key messages with many meta narratives emerging from the range of cards the children chose, as well as their discussion with each other when asked to put them into a particular order. There was also opportunity for asking slightly different questions to look more closely at the ways the children interpreted the project e.g. they were asked what they enjoyed the most, and, what is the most important part of the project’. In this test, it was clear that the children felt that working on a real project, with real world impact was the most enjoyable and the most important part of the project. The key messages around medicine use are therefore heightened by the way in which the project was set up and delivered, working with professional artists and the health board. The card sort method proved especially effective with this age group of children, where they really thought about the messages on the card

and held significant discussion and debate with each other about what they felt was most important. The set-up also worked well with the children while working on the project and during events and activities associated with the project.

VOX POP – the exhibition event provided ideal opportunity to gather feedback from the attendees with specific attention given to the benefits of working with artists on a project like this. Some of the feedback is included here. People overseeing the project said:

‘It is absolutely important to have high quality artists on board they are the ones that can deliver the real impact and really get the message out there. It is a great way to communicate via (a) the posters and (b) also the engagement with children. To get them so involved via creative activities makes them understand the messages better and then they influence their parents and family members more. The children have learnt along this journey and so this is great. This really has been a ground-breaking project’.

Other invited guests said:

‘Posters traditionally display a summary of a project whereas these demonstrate key messages in eye catching ways and draw you in. Traditionally you hone in on the posters you already know something about whereas these all grab your attention and make you want to read the messages and know more.’

‘For the artists, projects like these demonstrate that you can produce artworks of the highest quality and at the same time deliver clear health and well-being benefits. Health care professionals want to show how including artists in projects can deliver better and more impactful projects outcomes especially when delivering key messages to the general public.’

‘This model can be adapted to tackle other health issues for example obesity, this is a major issue in deprived areas in Wales. The model can be drawn out to address this issue and many more as I think the only way we are going to get through to the parents is through the children. It was clear looking at the children’s faces when John was talking that they are all going to go home and throw out medicines! They really were taking everything on board!’

‘The strap lines are amazing, the children say things in such different ways, it is so clever to help deliver these messages. Maybe even in the future the children could talk about the project to older groups and explain themselves, what they have done and why they have done it’.

‘When you see the work involved in how they got to this place it really is amazing, a whole collaboration – it is really clever. Having the artists involved really does make it come alive and make the messages have a real impact. There are so many clever messages and so clever they way they think about every little bit like the green edges on the purple there you can see that is a heart beating representation. It has all been so considered and the artist makes it so much more powerful.’

REFLECTION

The project successfully connected with children and has developed creative ways to implement behaviour change related to medicine use in Wales. Professional posters with new, playful and impactful messages are a key output, along with a teachers’ pack to deliver on the curriculum. The methods of evaluation tested in the project were especially effective in gauging the children’s responses. The case study acts as an exemplar of simple evaluation

methods to deploy at various stages throughout a projects life-cycle, in terms of organising outcomes (timed entries), getting feedback during activities (card sort) and maximising input during dissemination activities (Vox Pop).

7. ETHICS

Ethical considerations are fundamental to anybody working in participatory arts. All projects within participatory arts project will have different degrees of ethical concerns. An 'Informed Consent' Card is included in each pack.

Below is an ethics proforma sample used for this project to develop the Artworks Cymru Evaluation Cards. When writing ethics pro formas consider are any of your participants vulnerable, will you name and use images of your participants, how will the project be disseminated e.g. online, social media, websites, who owns any images generated.

ETHICS PRO FORMA

Dear Participant

This is an invitation to take part in research and evaluation for our "XXX" project

What is the purpose of this project?

The main purpose is to better understand why people take part in community and participatory arts projects. Our project "XXX" is one of several that have been selected to help carry out this research. In order to achieve this, we need to find out which methods of evaluation are most helpful for participants and the artists delivering the projects.

Why are you being asked to take part in this project?

You have selected to take part in this project because "XXX".

Do you have to take part?

Participation in the research is entirely voluntary, so you don't have to take part if you don't want to. If this is the case, you will still be able to take part in the "XXX" project [i.e. workshops]. If you decide not to take part in the research this will not in any way affect your membership or participation in the group or impact upon your relationship with the session leader.

Your right to withdraw

If at any point you decide that you no longer want to take part in this research and evaluation, you are free to withdraw. All you need to do is let me know, either in person or using my contact details below.

What will happen if I take part in the project?

The evaluations will be conducted at [venue] over the course [time and duration]. The evaluation methods we are using will involve you looking at four or five images and saying anything that comes to mind about them, this will happen at the beginning and end of each session. The idea is simply to understand how you are feeling at the start and end of each session. With your consent we would like to record your experience using a voice recorder to help us remember everything that is being said. We may also make notes of comments made.

What are the benefits of taking part?

By agreeing to take part in this project, you will be helping me to gain insight into the possible benefits of taking part in participatory art projects, so that we can continue to ensure that these projects are properly funded and understood by participants, artists/session leaders, policy makers and funders.

How will my privacy be protected?

All of the recordings and information resulting from the evaluation will be stored safely. At the end of the project, the information we gather will be used for reports, articles and presentations - however, it will not be possible to identify you individually.

If I am happy to take part, what do I do now?

If you agree to take part in this project, please complete and sign the attached consent form and return it to me using the contact details below.

Who do I speak to if I have any questions?

If you need to know anything else about the project, you can contact me: Your name and contact details

Alternatively, if you would like to speak to somebody else about the project, you can contact the research team for Artworks Cymru: *Researchers contact details go here*

Thank you for taking the time to read this.

Name of Project Leader

PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM

Please read the following statements and write your initials in the 'yes' or 'no' box.

	Yes	No
Have you read the information, or had it verbally explained to you?		
Have you received enough information about the project?		
Do you understand that participation is completely voluntary and you can withdraw at any time without having to give a reason?		
Do you consent to take part in the evaluation?		
Are you happy for us to record your comments using an audio recorder?		
I AGREE that my comments can be used in reports, articles and presentations about the project.		

Please date and sign below to indicate that you understand and accept the conditions of this evaluation. Thank you.

Name of participant:

Name of researcher:

Signature of participant:

Signature of participant:

Date:

Date: